

REGIONAL **ETHICS BOWL** **CASES**

FALL 2012

Prepared by:

Rhiannon D. Funke, Chair

Case Writers:

Susanna Flavia Boxall

Michael B. Funke

Gretchen A. Myers

Adam Potthast

© Association for Practical and Professional Ethics 2012

Editor's Note: Please note that source materials cited may be used multiple times, but only identified once per case.

Case 1 Plagiarism or Inspiration?

The prescribed consequence for students who engage in plagiarism is the so-called “Double F.”¹ This mark is like a scarlet double letter indicating academic dishonesty and can plague a student for the rest of his career, both in school and beyond. The rules against plagiarism are simple and universal: if you use someone else’s unique idea or words, give attribution.² However, the boundaries of plagiarism are sometimes murky and in fact, even educators charged with enforcing standards of academic integrity may find that they have crossed the line. That is exactly what happened to Arizona State University professor, Matthew Whitaker.³

During a promotion review, accusations arose that Whitaker used exact verbiage from printed articles in his speeches without attributing their source and also used Wikipedia articles without attribution in as many as six of his books. After an investigation, the university determined that his acts were not “systematic or substantial plagiarism” but did create some cause for concern. Whitaker claims that his detractors are motivated not by a concern for academic integrity but also by racism, as he is African American.

Regardless of the motivations of the committee who made these allegations, some question the validity of the charges. Wikipedia is an open source, which does not demand attribution based on its terms of use.⁴ More specifically, Wikipedia’s article on open sources states that:

Sites such as Wikipedia and Wiktionary have embraced the open-content [GFDL](#) and [Creative Commons](#) content licenses Many of these licenses ensure that content remains free for re-use, that source documents are made readily available to interested parties, and that changes to content are accepted easily back into the system.

Further, the conventions on attributions during a speech are less well-defined than those for the written word. Complete citation is awkward and disruptive during a typical public speaking event. However, academic integrity may require some degree of credit to be given to the source of an idea and/or prose in a speech.

¹ David Hayes, Kathy Hurtt, and Sarah Bee, “The War on Fraud: Reducing Cheating in the Classroom,” *Journal of College Teaching & Learning*, Feb. 2006, Vol. 3, No. 2, <http://cluteonline.com/journals/index.php/TLC/article/view/1742/1722>.

² For more information on Plagiarism, visit <http://www.plagiarism.org/>.

³ Anne Ryman, “ASU History Professor at Center of Plagiarism Debate,” *The Arizona Republic*, May 6, 2012, <http://www.azcentral.com/arizonarepublic/news/articles/2012/04/26/20120426asu-professor-plagiarism-debate.html>

⁴ “Open Source: Applications, Digital Content,” *Wikipedia*, June 25, 2012, http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Open_source.

Case 2 “Street Art”: Vandalism or Philanthropy?

In the art world, people get their start in some surprising places. In 2008 Shepard Fairey produced a stylized image of Barack Obama underscored with the word ‘HOPE.’ This image became an iconic symbol of Obama’s presidential campaign. Though this image made Fairey a household name, his work had already been seen by many in graffiti and stickers affixed to buildings, street signs, park benches, etc. Despite his work’s notoriety, Fairey remained relatively underground (as part of the counter culture) until 2008 in part because his art—tagging, street art, or graffiti—exists in what he describes as a “legal grey area.”¹ Fairey, like many street artists, has been arrested numerous times.

Opponents of graffiti argue that “Graffiti is ugly...Graffiti is an eyesore that decreases property values, is a drain on tax dollars and makes residents feel unsafe.”² Some reports indicate that Graffiti clean-up costs each taxpayer between one and three dollars annually. In most places there is legislation that addresses graffiti with specific definitions and penalties. For instance, according to Florida statutes graffiti resulting in less than \$1,000 in damage is a misdemeanor offense with subsequent infractions constituting a third degree felony.³

Free speech advocates argue that graffiti is a legitimate form of artistic self-expression and that the costs associated with graffiti removal and decreased property values are the product of social prejudice. One such advocate describes graffiti artists as painting “murals in celebration of line, color, and the beauty of life on a dull gray train trestle for the viewing pleasure of people on their way to work, all without demanding a cent for the service.”⁴ Some emphasize that graffiti is supposed to be troubling and is disliked because of the political and social messages it conveys. Others highlight the fact that graffiti competes for expressive space with messages delivered in traditional commercial and political advertising and argue that graffiti gives a voice to someone other than marketers and politicians in public spaces.

One widely proposed resolution to the spread of graffiti is the production of public mural walls, or the designation of certain walls as “legal” walls or walls open to public art. Legal walls are popular in many cities, but graffiti artists sometimes reject legal walls in favor of walls with better placement in terms of viewership, artistic context, surface characteristics, permanence, etc. Also, critics of legal walls argue that legal graffiti walls encourage the development and spread of graffiti and are thus counterproductive “oozing” into adjacent areas.⁵

Recently a painting by renowned British street-artist Banksy was discovered on the wall of an abandoned Packard plant in Detroit. Within days a local gallery had gathered the resources necessary to cut away the Banksy portion of the block wall, crate the wall and move it to their Gallery near I-75. The owner of the Packard plant filed suit, alleging that the gallery had stolen a

¹ Banksy, Rhys Ifans, and Shepard Fairey. 2010. *Exit through the gift shop*. [United States]: Mongrel.

² City of San Antonio Official Website: Code Enforcement Division, Graffiti.
<http://www.sanantonio.gov/ces/graffiti.aspx/thefacts.asp>.

³ Florida Statute § 806.13 (2012).

⁴ Caleb Neelson “Critical terms for Graffiti study,” 2003, http://www.graffiti.org/faq/critical_terms_sonik.html.

⁵ “Graffiti “Free” or “Sanctioned” Walls Vignettes from All Over,” <http://www.nograffiti.com/files/freewalls.htm>.

work of art worth in the area of \$100,000.⁶ Some in the art community maintain that the piece has no value once removed from its street context, but recent gallery shows reveal that the work of prominent street artists can be very valuable. This gathering commercial value may raise a new challenge to restrictions on graffiti and ironically may limit the artistic value of the work.

⁶ Jamie Wetherbe, "Salvaged Banksy artwork goes on display in Detroit" *Los Angeles Times*, April 27, 2012, <http://articles.latimes.com/2012/apr/27/entertainment/la-et-cm-banksy-mural-debuts-in-detroit-gallery-20120426>.

Case 3

Rape Jokes and Popular Culture

In late 2011, Facebook gained some public notoriety (and support) when it refused to take down a page on its site entitled, "You know she's playing hard to get when your [sic] chasing her down an alleyway". The page was created by a user who thought it was a funny joke. The page, and others like it, came under attack from support groups and charities for victims of rape and sexual assault who asked that it be taken down as a violation of Facebook's Terms of Service (which bans "content that is hateful, threatening, or pornographic; incites violence; or contains nudity or graphic or gratuitous violence"¹). Due, in part, to the controversy, the page gained more than 190,000 "likes" before Facebook finally took it down².

A page on a social networking site trumpeting rape humor is hardly an anomaly in contemporary popular culture. Hundreds, if not thousands of jokes involving rape are posted to social networking site Twitter each day, rape jokes are a surprisingly regular feature of the new CBS comedy "2 Broke Girls"^{3,4} and t-shirt designers online offer t-shirts that feature sayings such as "No + Rohypnol = Yes"⁵. While jokes about rape and sexual assault certainly aren't modern inventions, their apparent rise in prevalence and acceptance has many groups worried.

Victims support groups maintain that rape jokes contribute to a phenomenon they call "rape culture". This term first came to prominence among feminists in the 1970s as a way of describing the cultural features and stereotypes that lead to a tacit acceptance of rape, sexual assault, sexual harassment, and blaming (either wholly or in part) the victims of rape, sexual assault, and sexual harassment for the crimes committed against them. Recent research by social psychologists at the University of Kent suggests that men who are primed with sexist jokes have greater self-reported "rape proclivity" than those who do not, and are more prone to see acquaintance rape as less serious⁶.

Those who defend rape humor argue that there is a difference between telling, writing, spreading, and laughing at rape humor and condoning or celebrating rape. They maintain that opponents of joking about rape are committing the error of taking humor too seriously. Often, they maintain, people tell jokes about things that make them nervous or upset in order to defuse tension and make people less upset. Humor is often used as a kind of defense mechanism against the worst of humanity's sins in order to keep from losing hope altogether. They may appeal to theories of laughter such as the one in V. S. Ramachandran's *A Brief Tour of Human*

¹ Statement of Rights and Responsibilities, Facebook, June 8, 2012. <http://www.facebook.com/legal/terms>.

² "Facebook rape joke pages taken down from social network," *BBC News Technology*, November 8, 2011. <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/technology-15641998>.

³ Margaret Lyons, "The Sitcom Season in Rape Jokes," *New York Magazine: Vulture*, January 20, 2012. <http://www.vulture.com/2012/01/rape-jokes-sitcoms-broke-girls.html>.

⁴ Tricia Romano, "Rainn Wilson, '2 Broke Girls,' and the Rise of the Rape Joke," *The Daily Beast*, February 22, 2012. <http://www.thedailybeast.com/articles/2012/02/22/rainn-wilson-2-broke-girls-and-the-rise-of-the-rape-joke.html>.

⁵ Sarah Graham, "If you thought Topman's misogynist t-shirts were bad," *La Petite Feministe Anglaise*, October 7, 2011. <http://petitefeministe.tumblr.com/post/11147722684/trigger-warning-rape-if-you-thought-topmans>.

⁶ G. Tendayi Viki, Manuela Thome, and Amy Cullen, *et al.*, "The Effect of Sexist Humor and Type of Rape on Men's Self-Reported Rape Proclivity and Victim Blame," *Current Research in Social Psychology*, Vol. 13, No. 10, December 2007.

*Consciousness*⁷ which speculates that laughter evolved to defuse tension after recognizing that a perceived threat is not a real threat.

⁷ V.S. Ramachandran, *A Brief Tour of Human Consciousness*. Pi Press. 21-23. 2004.

Case 4 Paid Maternity Leave

Julia and Mark, residents of the German city of Ingolstadt, just had their first child. As they bring their baby girl home, Mark and Julia are eager to spend the next six months away from their jobs to exclusively nurture their new family member. Neither Mark nor Julia are worried about their job security or their ability to pay their bills, for Germany allows parents to take up to 47 weeks of paid leave and ensures that their jobs will be protected during their absence.¹ Meanwhile, Bernardette, a Wal-Mart employee in New Mexico, is back at work five weeks after the birth of her second child. Despite having had a difficult labor and post-partum complications, Bernardette's maternity leave was limited to the vacation and sick days she had accumulated the previous year. Taking a longer leave, like Julia and Mark's, would have jeopardized her job and hence the family's financial health.

Bernardette's case is not unique. In the U.S. only 50% of workers are covered under the Family and Medical Leave Act, which enables new parents to take 12 weeks of *unpaid* leave. Furthermore, according to a Human Rights Watch report released in February of 2011, American working parents and their children are harmed by the absence of legislation guaranteeing paid maternity leave.² In the case of single mothers, say advocates of paid maternity leave, the adverse effects of parenthood increase exponentially.³ According to sociologist Leonard Lopoo, each child a woman has on average increases her probability of being poor by 5.4 percentage points.

In addition to putting new parents in a precarious financial position, the absence of paid maternity leave also affects children. New mothers who return to work shortly after giving birth are less likely to breastfeed for the first 6 months of their babies' lives – a practice recommended by the World Health Organization and the American Dietetic Association for providing a host of health benefits to both mothers and their children.⁴ ⁵ Conversely, the research shows that paid maternity leave is “associated with increased breastfeeding, lower infant mortality, higher rates of immunization and health visits for babies, and lower risk of postpartum depression.”

While the benefits of paid maternity leave seem to be many, business owners have argued that a federal leave mandate would be too burdensome and costly – especially during tough economic times. Furthermore, some opponents of a paid maternity leave system worry that this program might undermine women's participation in the labor market. For example, a study on the effects of maternity leave policies in Western Europe has shown that German women who take “...a year of parental leave cut...[their] five-year wage growth rate by one-third.”⁶ The

¹ Sharon Lerner, *The War on Moms*. Hoboken: Wiley & Sons, 2010, p. 100, 102, 98, 87 (cited below, respectively).

² Human Rights Watch, “US: Lack of Paid Leave Harms Workers, Children,” February 23, 2011.

<http://www.hrw.org/news/2011/02/23/us-lack-paid-leave-harms-workers-children>.

³ Jennifer Ludden, “Working Moms' Challenges: Paid Leave, Child Care,” April 20, 2012.

<http://www.npr.org/2012/04/20/150967376/working-moms-challenges-paid-leave-child-care>.

⁴ WHO <http://www.who.int/topics/breastfeeding/en/>.

⁵ D.C. James, and R. Lessen, “Position of the American Dietetic Association: promoting and supporting breastfeeding.” *Journal of the American Dietetic Association*, 2009 Nov, 109(11):1926-42.

⁶ Kimberly Morgan and Kathrin Zippel, “Paid to Care: The Origins and Effects of Care Leave Policies in Western Europe,” *Social Politics: International Studies in Gender, State and Society* 10.1, 2003, p. 70, 49.

same study also reports that in countries such as Finland, where child care leaves are extended and compensated, employers perceive hiring women to be a risky and expensive move – given the cost associated with finding “replacements during their absence from work.” Hence, adopting a paid leave policy in the U.S. could contribute to women’s unequal role in the workforce – by worsening the existing gender wage-gap⁷ – while also reinforcing “the traditional division of care work in the home.”

⁷ Jennifer Perry and David Gundersen, “American Women and the Gender Pay Gap: A Changing Demographic or the Same Old Song,” *Advancing Women in Leadership*. Vol 21, pp. 153-159, 2011.

Case 5 Racial Justice Act

Marcus Reymond Robinson's death sentence has been changed to life in prison after a judge found racial bias played a significant role in jury selection at his trial 18 years ago. At Robinson's hearing, defense counsel introduced a statistical analysis of racial disparity in jury selection in North Carolina death penalty cases. The study indicated that, even after controlling for other variables, prosecutors removed African Americans as potential jurors significantly more often than they removed Caucasians.¹ The judge concluded that Robinson had shown "the persistent, pervasive, and distorting role of race in jury selection throughout North Carolina [at the time of the trial]." He further ruled that, "evidence, largely unrebutted by the state, requires relief in this case and should serve as a clear signal of the need for reform in the capital jury selection proceedings." Robinson was resentenced under North Carolina's controversial Racial Justice Act.²

Under the Racial Justice Act, a prisoner sentenced to death may argue that race was a significant factor leading to his death sentence in order to have his sentence commuted to life in prison without parole. Prisoners can prove bias in three different ways: (1) they can show that the death penalty was more likely when the defendant was a particular race; (2) they can show that the death penalty was more likely when the victim was a particular race; and (3) they can show that jury selection was tainted by racial bias. To make their argument, prisoners can use statistics showing racial disparity in sentencing within a county or district or even throughout the state. Almost all of North Carolina's death row inmates have filed claims pursuant the Act.

But not everyone in North Carolina has welcomed the new standards allowed by the Racial Justice Act. A bill has been introduced in the North Carolina legislature that some believe, if passed into law, would essentially negate the Racial Justice Act. The bill would require a defendant or inmate to introduce "smoking gun" evidence of racial bias—a prosecutor's racist comment or membership in a racist organization, for example—before statistical evidence would be admissible. It also limits the statistical evidence by allowing it only from the time period ten years before the crime was committed and two years after sentencing and only from the district or county where the crime was committed. Those who support the bill argue that it is simply a reform of the Act and that it prevents prosecutors from being unfairly labeled as racists. Those who oppose the bill, on the other hand, believe that allowing the introduction of statistical proof is necessary to expose the racial bias that is causing minorities to be disproportionately sentenced to death.³

¹ Campbell Robertson, "Bias Law Used to Move a Man Off Death Row," *The New York Times*, April 20, 2012, http://www.nytimes.com/2012/04/21/us/north-carolina-law-used-to-set-aside-a-death-sentence.html?_r=2; see also Eyder Peralta, "In First Test For Racial Justice Act, Judge Commutes Man's Death Sentence," *National Public Radio*, April 20, 2012, <http://www.npr.org/blogs/thetwo-way/2012/04/20/151061036/in-first-test-for-racial-justice-act-judge-commutes-mans-death-sentence>.

² Sarah Preston, "Historic Racial Justice Act Faces Repeal," *American Civil Liberties Union*, June 14, 2012, <http://www.aclu.org/blog/capital-punishment-racial-justice/historic-racial-justice-act-faces-repeal>.

³ Craig Jarvis, "Senate Passes Re-Write of Racial Justice Act," *NewsObserver.com*, June 20, 2012, <http://www.newsobserver.com/2012/06/20/2149771/senate-passes-rewrite-of-racial.html>.

Case 6 Student Loan Forgiveness Case

As higher education becomes an increasingly essential qualification for jobs and the price of higher education rises, many middle and lower class students have turned to low-interest student loans to finance higher education. Lately, however, student loan debt has soared to \$1 trillion dollars and many recent graduates report having trouble finding a job in a slowly recovering economy. Faced with large amounts of student loan debt and no way to repay those debts, default rates are on the rise, with 8.8% of borrowers defaulting two years into repayment in 2009¹. Many recent graduates believe they were not properly informed of the risks of taking out large loans to finance an education, especially with news that interest rates are set to rise to 6.8% in 2012 (absent action from Congress)².

Troubled economic patterns make up a perfect storm for a bill like the Student Loan Forgiveness Act of 2012, which was submitted to Congress earlier this year by Michigan Congressman Hansen Clarke. The bill is intended to lessen the crippling amount of debt that some students have incurred by pursuing higher education in a tough job market. The bill would go a long way towards lessening the burden on borrowers: capping interest rates at 3.4%, offering forgiveness of loans after 10 years of payments, and strengthening programs that trade loan forgiveness for public work. But relief for borrowers is not the only goal of the bill. Supporters of the bill cite the overall economic benefits of loan forgiveness as well. Billions of dollars that are now going into paying off student loans could presumably find their ways into the pockets of business owners, large and small, causing demand for products and services to rise and creating a cascade of new jobs to fulfill that demand.

However not everyone is thrilled with the idea of bailing out struggling students and criticism comes from some surprising sources.

Although the goal of attending the college of one's dreams frequently over-shadows it, those who took on student loans are required to be informed of the risks of carrying debt into uncertain times. While no one could predict an economic collapse, students who started college in 2008 should have known they were entering college during a financial crisis. And there are many ways that students could avoid paying more money for loans such as attending less expensive state schools or working while earning credit at community colleges. Students were, by and large, consenting adults who signed papers promising to repay. Furthermore, no relief is extended to students who worked to pay for their educations without taking out student loans. So the act seems to punish those whose ambitions caused them to work harder during college than some of their peers.

But perhaps more importantly, while no one is saying that debt-burdened college graduates don't encounter hardships when they can't find a job after college, these people are, statistically speaking, nowhere close to the least well-off in society. College graduates in 2011

¹ Tanar Lewin. "Student Loan Default Rates Rise Sharply in Last Year," *The New York Times*. September 12, 2011, <http://www.nytimes.com/2011/09/13/education/13loans.html>.

² Jennifer Liberto, "Student loan rate hike: what you need to know," *CNN: Money*, April 24, 2012, http://money.cnn.com/2012/04/24/pf/college/student_loans/index.htm.

overall are half as likely to be unemployed as those with just a high school diploma, and are almost three times as likely to be employed versus someone without a high school diploma³. Even unemployed college graduates still have a college education — no small qualification in the job market. Those without higher education are suffering even more in the poor economy, since they do not even have the entry requirements to higher-paying jobs. Funds that would go toward relieving student loan debt could be targeted at programs that serve the poor and under-educated by offering job training or welfare assistance. Perhaps funds would be better directed at improving the plight of the least well-off rather than younger, college-educated people in the prime of their lives.

³ Bureau of Labor Statistics, “Education pays in higher earnings and lower unemployment rates,” March 23, 2012. http://www.bls.gov/emp/ep_chart_001.htm.

Case 7 Indian Family Law

India is among the world's largest nations, is home to the second largest population (over 1 billion people), and has incredible religious diversity. Article 44 of the Indian Constitution requires a uniform civil code throughout India, but at present much of Indian civil law is based on traditional case law.¹ A key element of Indian civil law includes the separation of some elements of personal or family law (marriage, divorce, child custody, inheritance, alimony, etc.) into three separate streams of jurisprudence: Hindu, Muslim, and Christian. The effect of this tradition is that Hindus, Muslims, and Christians are each governed by a distinct set of legal rules with respect to civil family institutions, though they share a criminal code which also affects family life.

During the English colonial period of India's history, Warren Hasting, a British legislator who helped mold India's civil justice system, attempted to integrate cultural sensitivity into India's family law system. Hasting acknowledged that Hindu and Muslim traditions were integral to Indian identity and spearheaded the integration of traditional religious texts and leaders into the Western legal system. Arguably, Hasting's aim was to acknowledge and respect the indigenous traditions of India. Similarly, feminist scholars in the West have argued that impartial justice is an inappropriate standard in the evaluation of family affairs, preferring more personal standards of care.

The Indian legal system's sensitivity to religious faith stands in stark contrast to the legal system of the United States, which is ostensibly religiously neutral. The U.S. system is inspired by a longstanding western ideal of impartiality in the administration of justice represented by the Greek Goddess, Themis, blindfolded holding a sword in one hand and scales in the other. In this tradition, impartiality is thought to be the best method for reaching justice. As a result, in the U.S. personal legal disputes such as marriage and divorce are governed by a secular legal system insulated from the various religious traditions widely affiliated with personal and family matters.

For decades, women and women's groups in India and abroad have objected to the use of traditional religious laws such as Sharia and Dharmaśāstra. Under Sharia law, Muslim women have been denied divorce, child custody, and maintenance because of misogynistic gender norms within traditional Islam. For example Shah Bano, a 62- year-old Muslim woman, was divorced by her husband and was initially awarded maintenance or alimony payments available to women of other faiths under the Indian criminal code. However, subsequent legislation and courts held that as a Muslim woman, Bano was only eligible for three months of alimony after which it was expected that she would be cared for by relatives.²

¹Indian Const. 1950. Art. 44 Online at: <http://lawmin.nic.in/olwing/coi/coi-english/coi-indexenglish.htm>; Anil and Ranjit Malhotra "Family Law And Religion -The Indian Experience," *International Association of Matrimonial Lawyers Law Journal*,

http://www.iaml.org/cms_media/files/family_law_and_religion_the_indian_experience.pdf?static=1.

² *Mohd. Ahmed Khan vs Shah Bano Begum And Ors*, 1985 AIR 945, 1985 SCC (2) 556 (Indian Supreme Court, 1985), <http://indiankanoon.org/doc/823221/>.

Case 8 Gay Conversion Therapy

Psychiatrist Robert Spitzer recently renounced his 2003 study that supported gay conversion therapy. “I owe the gay community an apology,” Dr. Spitzer wrote. In the 1970s, Dr. Spitzer was championed by the gay community when he challenged the classification of homosexuality as an illness—“sociopathic personality disturbance.” He proposed an alternative classification, “sexual orientation disturbance,” that identified those whose sexual orientation (gay or straight) caused them distress. This alternative classification was accepted in 1973, and the gay community saw this as a victory.

In the late 1990s, Dr. Spitzer became interested in the idea of gay conversion therapy—a concept based on the Freudian theory that everyone is born bisexual and that sexual orientation is malleable. At the time, gay conversion therapy had gained traction with various conservative groups and was being promoted by The National Association for Research and Therapy of Homosexuality (NARTH). Dr. Spitzer conducted a study on the subject, interviewing 200 people who had undergone conversion therapy. A majority of the subjects reported that they had been successfully converted from either predominantly or exclusively homosexual to either predominantly or exclusively heterosexual. Advocates of conversion therapy were excited by the findings, but others were concerned that the study was flawed. Because people lie, it would be impossible to determine whether the therapy had truly worked by simply asking the patients. Dr. Spitzer himself now agrees that the study was flawed.¹

Some still claim that gay conversion therapy works and is beneficial to those who want to change. NARTH is dedicated to “uphold[ing] the rights of individuals with unwanted homosexual attraction to receive effective psychological care and the rights of professionals to offer that care.” The organization has responded to Dr. Spitzer’s admission by stating that the science of his study is still accurate and that it is still plausible that some of the participants were actually changed by the therapy.²

Even if it is possible to change one’s sexual orientation through therapy, however, the question remains whether it is even a laudable goal. Conversion therapy is based on the assumption that it is preferable to be heterosexual rather than homosexual. For this reason, it reinforces the social stigma against being gay and privileges heterosexuality as the norm. But—if successful—conversion therapy could also allow people to escape that same stigma by becoming heterosexual.

¹ Benedict Carey, “Psychiatry Giant Sorry for Backing Gay ‘Cure,’” *The New York Times*, May 18, 2012; see also Gabriel Arana, “My So-Called Ex-Gay Life,” *The Prospect*, <http://prospect.org/article/my-so-called-ex-gay-life>, April 11, 2012; Reza Gostar, Pan American Health Organization Denounces Gay Conversion Therapy, <http://redondobeach.patch.com/articles/major-health-organization-denounces-gay-conversion-therapy>, May 19, 2012.

² NARTH.com; NARTH Mission Statement

Case 9 There is an App for THAT!

Microsoft has recently filed a patent for a navigation application (app), which allows pedestrians to choose the safest walking route by combining GPS technology with “information from maps, weather reports, crime statistics and demographics.”¹ Microsoft has not yet released the app, but the product has already stirred controversy among scholars, technology users, business owners and the NAACP, earning the infamous nickname “avoid-ghetto app.” Unlike other commonly used navigation programs, such as Google Maps, which simply give users the shortest distance between two locations, Microsoft’s app has the ability to guide pedestrians away from neighborhoods that it deems unsafe. As explained in the patent application, pedestrians using this app are routed “through neighborhoods with violent crime statistics below a certain threshold.”² Some technology experts have praised the app for being the next logical step in intelligent navigation technology. If people want to avoid dangerous places, so the argument goes, this technology is merely a tool that can help them arrive at their destination safely.

While users’ desire for safety is understandable, some scholars have argued that this new technology is hardly innocuous. According to Dr. Sarah Chinn, an expert in racism and technology, the app in question simply reinforces stereotypes about non-whites and perpetuates the faulty assumption “that criminality and being poor and not white go hand in hand... , when [i]n reality, FBI crime statistics for 2010 show that whites were arrested more often for violent crimes that year than any other race.” The president of Dallas’ NAACP echoed Chinn’s assessment of the new app when she condemned Microsoft for developing a product that reinforces racist stereotypes. Furthermore, business owners have worried about the economic consequences of developing a product that can potentially drive away customers. A downtown Dallas business owner expressed his dismay when he said that Microsoft’s app would be devastating, “[e]specially in the area of tourism.”³

Because the app has not been released yet, it is unclear whether it will systematically route pedestrians away from non-white and low-income neighborhoods. Nevertheless, the controversy sparked by Microsoft’s product has created a fruitful discussion about the social implications of using technology to mediate our interaction with our environment. As Jim Thatcher, a scholar of geospatial geography, has argued, creators of navigation technologies utilize “private data and algorithms, and [are] able to select what areas of the environment are rendered visible and invisible.”⁴ Thus, as this technology becomes increasingly common, we must “ask what they preclude from consideration.”

1 Danielle Cadet, “Microsoft ‘Avoid Ghetto’ App Sparks Controversy.” *The Huffington Post*. Jan. 19, 2012. http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2012/01/19/microsoft-avoid-ghetto-ap_n_1217398.html.

2 Allison Keyes. “This App was Made of Walking – But is it Racist?” *NPR.org*. Jan. 25, 2012. <http://www.npr.org/2012/01/25/145337346/this-app-was-made-for-walking-but-is-it-racist>.

3 Sharrie Williams, “App That Would Guide Users Away From High-Crime Areas Proves Controversial,” *CBSDFW.com*, Jan. 17, 2012. <http://dfw.cbslocal.com/2012/01/17/app-that-would-guide-users-away-from-high-crime-areas-proves-controversial/>.

4 Jim Thatcher (Clark University), “Can we get there from here? Teleological Red-Lining and Avoiding the Ghetto.” *Antipode Foundation*, March 14, 2012. <http://antipodefoundation.org/2012/03/14/can-we-get-there-from-here-teleological-red-lining-and-avoiding-the-ghetto/>.

Case 10 Who Feeds Fido?

According to Richard Avanzino, former president of the San Francisco Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals, around 150,000 cats and dogs are abandoned each year due to the death of an owner.¹ However, increasingly pet owners have begun to make arrangements for their pets' care in the event of the owner's death. Because pets are legally property and cannot inherit directly, one solution is to establish a legal trust for the benefit of one's pet or pets — Leona Helmsley's will famously established a 12 million dollar trust for her dog Trouble.

In Helmsley's case a judge reduced the amount of the trust from 12 million to 2 million, but even the reduced amount was seen by many as excessive and wasteful. Carl Lekic, Trouble's caretaker, reportedly spent \$100,000 annually on her care — including \$8,000 for grooming and \$1,200 for dog food.² Other (less expensive) options include the Stevenson Companion Animal Life-Care Center, which charges between \$50,000 and \$100,000 for lifetime care, or the Blue Bell Foundation for Cats, which only charges \$6,500 for lifetime care.

When pets die before their trusts are exhausted, a variety of solutions have been employed. The remainder of Trouble's trust reverted to the Helmsley Family Foundation in 2011; profits from the Stevenson Companion Animal Life-Care Center revert to an affiliated college. However, when Gunther III, German Shepherd and eighty million dollar heir to a German countess, died, his estate passed to his son Gunther IV. Gunther IV's estate has more than tripled to over \$300 million and includes a home in Miami once owned by Madonna.³

In some jurisdictions trusts established for the benefit of pets are administered by trustees without legal provisions made to ensure that specific care requests are granted. Other jurisdictions have established formal provisions to ensure that trustees have more than an informal moral requirement to abide by the terms of a will.⁴ Still some wonder whether it is wise to establish and legally enforce a precedent of elaborately caring for one's pets after death. In a world where billions of people are food insecure or do not have access to adequate drinking water, it strikes many as morally unreasonable to abide by a will entitling a pet to such vast resources. However, it is morally unclear whether trustees should have discretion to put wealth willed to pets to use in helping people.

¹ Sue Manning, "Pet Estate Planning: Not just for Leona Helmsley anymore" *Today Show* (NBC) June 22, 2011, http://today.msnbc.msn.com/id/43503433/ns/today-today_pets_and_animals/t/pet-estate-planning-not-just-leona-helmsley-anymore/#.T-IZSRdYsTY.

² Susan Donaldson James, "Leona Helmsley's Little Rich Dog Trouble Dies in Luxury" *Good Morning America* (ABC) June 10, 2011, <http://abcnews.go.com/US/leona-helmsleys-dog-trouble-richest-world-dies-12/story?id=13810168#.T-IjHxdYsTY>.

³ Kerry Gold, "Pet Inheritance," <http://www.pettrustlawyer.com/files/lifestyle.pdf> (attorney blog).

⁴ "Pet Trusts: Caring for a pet that outlives its owner" *American Veterinary Medical Association*, Updated Aug. 2012, <https://www.avma.org/Advocacy/StateAndLocal/Pages/sr-pet-trusts.aspx>.

Case 11 Mean Girls

Just where is the line between the personal and the professional when it comes to the educational profession? Back in the days of single room schoolhouses, school marms were often subject to oppressive rules of conduct, one amusingly stating, “Women teachers who marry or engage in unseemly conduct will be dismissed.”¹ Over the past century and a half, however, female teachers seem to be afforded much greater freedom outside the classroom. This stems in part from the greater degree of anonymity teachers enjoy when they live in more populated communities. The women’s liberation movement and other philosophical movements have also fought for greater acceptance of women’s and teachers’ freedoms of speech and association and their autonomy as professionals.²

Present-day teachers are given much greater freedoms to behave as they choose outside the classroom; however, schools still regularly have codes of conduct for their employees.³ In the burgeoning age of social media, the boundaries of these rules are being tested. For instance, in one case, New York elementary school teacher Christine Rubino posted the following Facebook status: “After today, I am thinking the beach sounds like a wonderful idea for my 5th graders! I HATE THEIR GUTS! They are the devils (sic) spawn!”⁴ This statement was made after school hours the day after a student drowned while on a field trip to the beach. While Rubino took down the comment just days later, she was fired from her job, and only got her job back after a court ruled that the comments were not sufficient grounds for dismissal.⁵

While generally much less strict, students may also be subject to limitations on their speech.⁶ However, this is not always the case. Sometimes teachers find themselves the subject of their students’ criticism, struggling with how to cope with the freedom of speech of “cyber bullies”. One Land O’Lakes (Florida) High School teacher, Angelica Cruikshank, recently made headlines when she was terminated for her actions relating to “policing” students’ Facebook

¹ “School Rules—1872,” *New Hampshire Historical Society*, <http://www.nhhistory.org/edu/support/nhrowingup/teacherrules.pdf>.

² Kenneth A. Strike, “Professionalism, Democracy, and Discursive Communities: Normative Reflections on Restructuring,” *American Educational Research Journal*, Summer 1993, Vol. 30, No. 2, p. 255-275, <http://www.politicalscience.uncc.edu/godwink/PPOL8687/WK14%20April%2026%20School%20Organization/Strike%20Normative%20issues%20decentralization.pdf>.

³ See Helen Norton, “Constraining Public Employee Speech: Government’s Control of Its Workers’ Speech To Protect Its Own Expression,” *Duke Law Journal*, Oct. 2009, Vol. 59, No. 1, <http://scholarship.law.duke.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1435&context=dlj> (discussing how teachers are often still subject to strict off-duty behavior rules)

⁴ Evan Brown, “Teacher fired over Facebook post gets her job back,” *internetcases: Law & Technology* (blog), Feb. 9, 2012, <http://blog.internetcases.com/2012/02/09/facebook-privacy-employment-termination-contextual-integrity/>.

⁵ Anson N. Carter, “The impact various forms of Freedom of Speech has on students and administrators in an Educational Setting,” March 21, 2012, <http://openlab.citytech.cuny.edu/wp-content/uploads/group-documents/456/1337350104-LegalSeminarFinalDraft.docx>.

⁶ See Chris Boots, “Student questions regulations after Facebook censorship,” *The Chicago Maroon*, Feb. 3, 2009, <http://chicagomaroon.com/2009/02/03/student-questions-regulations-after-facebook-censorship/> (discussing student who posted Facebook page about his ex-girlfriend who allegedly cheated on him but was asked to take it down by university officials, citing the student code of conduct).

comments.⁷ In particular, Cruikshank demanded one student log into her Facebook account on Cruikshank's cell phone. Cruikshank did so to gain access to other students' Facebook comments about her. She also enlisted some students to review their classmates Facebook pages for derogatory comments, and refused to provide permissions slips for a museum fieldtrip to her Facebook bullies. Parents were outraged at Cruikshank's actions, and it is unknown at this time whether Cruikshank's termination was final or if she was reinstated.

Though Cruikshank's actions were clearly extreme, she was likely subject to codes of conduct that would have subjected her to punishment for making the very sorts of comments that she had to endure. It is not clear she had any way to address the criticisms of her student cyberbullies.

⁷Jeffrey S. Solocheck, "Pasco Teacher Accused of Policing Students' Facebook Comments," *Tampa Bay Times*, March 22, 2012, <http://www.tampabay.com/news/education/k12/article1221093.ece>; "Spanish teacher suspended after she 'forced students to show her their Facebook pages - and banned them from school trip if they insulted her,'" *The Daily Mail*, March 21, 2012, <http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-2118399/Teacher-Angelica-Cruikshank-banned-students-school-trip-badmoutheed-Facebook.html>.

Cases 12

Drug Legalization

Drug cartels have become a huge issue in South and Central American countries, where the drug trade has led to widespread violence and soaring murder rates. Many people disappear, and children are orphaned. Because law enforcement is often insufficient to adequately address the violence, most of these crimes are never solved and citizens are afraid to leave their homes after dark. People in the U.S. hear about the atrocities through headlines about specific, particularly shocking incidents—35 bodies left on a freeway, bodies dissolved in barrels of acid, someone’s face sewn to a soccer ball—but many of the drugs at the center of the violence are being brought into the U.S. without much ado.¹

The Guatemalan President, Otto Perez Molina, recently announced that he wants to legalize drugs and create a regulated drug market in an effort to curb drug-related violence. As Molina had previously supported using military force against the cartels, his sudden change of policy comes as a surprise to many. Molina claims that he changed his stance when he realized that his country was a “corridor of illegality” feeding the U.S.’s demand for drugs, and that he had insufficient law enforcement to suppress the violence.

Critics of Molina’s proposal include the president of El Salvador, Mauricio Funes, who has stated that he is against legalization: “Imagine what it would mean . . . Producing drugs would no longer be a crime, so trafficking drugs would no longer be a crime and consuming drugs would no longer be a crime, so we would be converting the region in[to] a paradise for drug consumption.”² U.S. officials, including Vice President Joe Biden, have also responded to Molina’s announcement by affirming that drugs should remain illegal because they are a major threat to public health and safety.³ Biden has also emphasized that the possible benefits of legalization, such as having fewer people in prison, would be outweighed by the costs, such as the need for an expensive bureaucracy for regulating drugs and addicts.⁴

¹ Mitchell Koss, “Central America’s bloody drug problem,” *CNN*, January 19, 2012, <http://www.cnn.com/2012/01/19/world/americas/narco-wars-guatemala-honduras/index.html>; Ashley Fantz, “The Mexico Drug War: Bodies for Billions,” *CNN*, January 20, 2012, <http://www.cnn.com/2012/01/15/world/mexico-drug-war-essay/index.html>.

² Romina Ruiz-Goiriena, “Guatemala Weighs Drug Legalization,” *The Huffington Post*, February 13, 2012, http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2012/02/13/guatemala-drug-legalization_n_1274717.html; Rachel Glickhouse, “Guatemala Update: Pérez Molina’s First 90 Days,” *Council of the Americas* (website), April 11, 2012, <http://www.as-coa.org/articles/guatemala-update-p%C3%A9rez-molina%E2%80%99s-first-90-days>.

³ Catherine E. Shoichet, “Guatemalan president leads drug legalization debate,” *CNN*, March 23, 2012, <http://www.cnn.com/2012/03/23/world/americas/guatemala-drug-legalization/index.html>.

⁴ Randal C. Archibold, “U.S. Remains Opposed to Drug Legalization, Biden Tells Region,” *The New York Times*, March 5, 2012, <http://www.nytimes.com/2012/03/06/world/americas/us-remains-against-drug-legalization-in-mexico-biden-says.html>.

Case 13 Free College Credit

Virtual learning via online courses has grown exponentially over the last several years.¹ “[Over four and a half] million students took a college-level online course during fall 2008, up 17 percent from a year earlier, according to the Sloan Survey of Online Learning.” Adjunct professorships have also been on the rise, nearly doubling in just the last three decades, going from 43 percent in the 1970’s to nearly 70 percent in 2007.²

These shifts, at least in part, can be attributed to financial benefits these strategies offer universities. Universities save on the costs of facilities (for online courses), and salaries and benefits (adjuncts). They can also boost their tuition income through wider availability of courses. Online courses permit thousands of students to register for the same course and/or register for more courses overall due to the flexibility in attending online classes. And adjuncts can teach the same number of courses as a tenured professor for less than a third of the cost.³

However, these benefits do not come without serious concerns. Administrators, educators, and even students were interviewed and indicated serious concerns about the decline in the quality of education available to students through these shifts in the modern American university model. And unfortunately, these cost saving strategies do not appear to have trickled down to the prime consumers of university offerings—the students.

The increase in college tuition has outpaced the rate of inflation for over 50 years.⁴ At the same time, employers’ demands for a college-educated workforce have also increased, such that many individuals find that a high school diploma no longer holds the same value in the job market.⁵ And since the credit crisis that started in 2008, student loan money has become harder and harder to obtain.⁶ Some students find that they invest tens or hundreds of thousands of dollars in an education, only to be denied the loans to complete their education. With the transition of the American higher educational system into a more economic model, some entities

¹ Trip Gabriel, “Learning in Dorm, Because Class Is on the Web,” *The New York Times*, Education, Nov. 7, 2010, <http://www.nytimes.com/2010/11/05/us/05college.html?pagewanted=all>.

² Alan Finder, “Decline of the Tenure Track Raises Concerns,” *The New York Times*, Education, Nov. 20, 2007, <http://www.nytimes.com/2007/11/20/education/20adjunct.html?pagewanted=all>.

³ For example, a generous adjunct position might pay \$2,500 per semester with little or no benefits. An average teaching load might consist of four classes per semester, rendering a total of \$20,000 annual income for an adjunct professor, as compared to an average annual salary of almost \$50,000 for a tenure-track professor. See “American Academic: A National Survey of Part-Time/Adjunct Faculty,” *American Federation of Teachers*, Vol. 2, March 2010, p. 4, http://www.aft.org/pdfs/highered/aa_partimefaculty0310.pdf, for a survey of adjunct faculty, their incomes, and their overall job satisfaction. For a non-scientific estimation of professor salaries, see *Salary.com*, which derives estimates from self-reported incomes, at <http://swz.salary.com/SalaryWizard/Professor-Philosophy-Salary-Details.aspx>

⁴ Mark Kantrowitz (Publisher), “Tuition Inflation,” www.finaid.org, 2012, <http://www.finaid.org/savings/tuition-inflation.phtml>.

⁵ Jacques Steinberg, “More Employers to Require Some College, Report Says,” *The New York Times*, June 14, 2010, <http://www.nytimes.com/2010/06/15/education/15degree.html>.

⁶ See Ron Lieber, “Placing the Blame as Students Are Buried in Debt,” *The New York Times*, May 28, 2010, <http://www.nytimes.com/2010/05/29/your-money/student-loans/29money.html?pagewanted=all> (anecdotal accounts of student loan difficulties).

are realizing that the value of an education may not lie in huge tuition bills, but in the straight acquisition of knowledge.

Recently several highly respected universities, including the Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT) and Harvard, announced a partnership to produce free online courses.⁷ The “massively open online courses,” or MOOCs, provide certificates of completion, but not college credit, as would help a student earn a degree. The courses received huge enrollment, with over 100,000 students initially enrolling in MIT’s first course, Circuits and Electronics, though less than a tenth of students completed the midterm. However, even with the huge attrition, the course has reached a vast audience of individuals who are taking advantage of first-rate educational materials from well-respected institutions.

While certificates of completion to evidence mastery of courses may satisfy some students, there is a large market for free, “legitimate” college credit that employers and other institutions have come to rely on as a sign of quality. Some institutions are working to provide such a thing. Companies like Straighter Line are trying to provide more widely accepted college credit for free online content by working on accreditation with the American Council on Education. Muddying the waters for such efforts are other online universities that offer what they call “internationally accredited” courses. While sounding more prestigious, such accreditation often does not translate into degrees that employers or other universities recognize.⁸

Students may still have an incentive to pay for their education in order to enjoy the full university experience and prestige associated with a traditional university degree. But free degrees may be the next wave of higher education as students struggle to gain the knowledge necessary to succeed and universities seek to truly serve their mission to provide affordable, quality education to the masses. However, as universities break from decades or even centuries of tradition, at least in terms of management and compensation, many question the value of an education provided without classrooms and professors.

⁷ Tamar Lewin, “Harvard and M.I.T. Team Up to Offer Free Online Courses,” *The New York Times*, May 2, 2012, <http://www.nytimes.com/2012/05/03/education/harvard-and-mit-team-up-to-offer-free-online-courses.html>; for a selection of free virtual courses, see <http://lifehacker.com/201979/technophilia-get-a-free-college-education-online>; <http://www.openculture.com/freeonlinecourses>.

⁸ For examples of for-profit colleges and their accreditation issues, see: <http://www.loansafe.org/private-for-profit-colleges-face-increased-state-oversight>; <http://www.lasvegassun.com/news/2012/jun/05/attorneys-general-target--profit-colleges-looking-/>; <http://www.wfaa.com/news/investigates/Regulators-revoke-accreditation-159802545.html>; <http://www.businessweek.com/ap/2012-06/D9VCEGF00.htm>.

Case 14 Caged rats

In a time of global terrorism and economic recession, the humane treatment of lab rats may not be high on many people's list of just causes, but that doesn't mean they don't have advocates.

Animal welfare advocates have long taken umbrage at the NIH (National Institute of Health)'s ambiguous position on animal welfare. Their argument is that the welfare of millions of laboratory animals is important and ought to be taken seriously, even if protecting that welfare constitutes an inconvenience or a financial burden.¹ One of the typical ways of affording laboratory animals some relief is giving them more space. Animal welfare advocates maintain that larger housing pens would improve rodents' wellbeing. According to ethologist J. P. Balcombe, studies have shown aggressive behavior among male mice when they were exclusively kept captive "in small, commercial cages."² In fact, the latest scientific research, which provides evidence of empathetic behavior among lab rats, suggests that the emotional capacities and needs of these rodents might be much more complex than previously thought.³

Perhaps in response to such concerns, for the first time since 1996, the NIH has updated its guidelines for the housing of laboratory animals. Research institutions wishing to secure funding from the NIH will supposedly have to comply with the new housing guide, which is designed to reduce the overcrowding of millions of rodents used for research every year in the U.S. The recommendations don't exactly specify deluxe accommodations, though. A mouse and her litter will be entitled to a minimum of 51 square inches, while a rat and her litter should get at least 124 square inches.⁴

Nevertheless, research institutions have objected to the new guidelines: giving each animal more room will require them to purchase more cages (and hire more staff to clean those cages), which means diverting money away from research on product safety, pharmaceuticals, and other causes that could improve the well-being of humanity. Furthermore, scientists argue, there is little research to substantiate the claim that rodents' quality of life would improve with larger cages. As Joseph Thulin of the Medical College of Wisconsin puts it, it is unclear whether more spacious enclosures "will have any measurable positive impact on the animals." If laboratory animals aren't going to experience any relief and fewer funds end up going to research, the new guidelines seem to be the equivalent of running in a wheel that ultimately doesn't go anywhere.

¹ Nell Greenfieldboyce, "Labs size up New Guidelines for Rodent Cages." *NPR.org*, Jan. 16, 2012, <http://www.npr.org/2012/01/16/145172737/labs-size-up-new-guidelines-for-rodent-cages>.

² J.P. Bolcombe, "Laboratory Environments and rodents' behavioural needs: a review" *Laboratory Animals*, Pg. 40 (2006), http://www.pcrm.org/pdfs/research/testing/exp/Lab_Env_2006.pdf.

³ Ben-Ami Bartal Inbal et al., "Empathy and Pro-Social Behavior in Rats," *Science*, 334, 1427 (2011), <http://www.sciencemag.org/content/334/6061/1427.abstract>.

⁴ National Research Council of the National Academies. "Guide for the Care and Use of Laboratory Animals" (8th ed.) Washington, D.C.: The National Academies Press, 2012. <http://grants.nih.gov/grants/olaw/Guide-for-the-Care-and-Use-of-Laboratory-Animals.pdf#page=83>.

The importance of the new guidelines seems further weakened by the NIH's assurance to researchers that the housing guidelines are just a recommendation for minimum standards. In fact, overcrowding will be allowed as long as it is justified by the research and "the animals' health or behavior won't suffer." The ambiguity in the NIH's response has left scientists wondering to what extent these guidelines will be enforced and whether non-compliance will affect funding.

Case 15 Family Ties and Business Ethics¹

Lucy's father worked for years developing his ship-building business. He spent long hours away from his family, mixing with financiers, sailors, and the occasional loan shark. But the business did not bring him happiness. Tragically, his two beloved sons, Lucy's brothers, died testing a new design of one of their father's ships. After and perhaps because of this accident, he became a hardened man. While the business had sufficient size to stay afloat, his personality spilled over into his management style, which caused tension amongst employees, suppliers, and investors. The business did little more than break even most years, and some years it did considerably worse, adding to Lucy's father's sourness and resentment.

Nevertheless, it was one of the major businesses in the town where Lucy grew up and was one of her only options for making a decent income that would put her through school. Lucy's father was always overbearing and gruff with her, pushing her to cut corners and raging when she didn't. He was never physically violent. He kept food on the table in times when others didn't have any — sometimes through dubious business deals — and provided a decent standard of living. The family was tight, if somewhat competitive, and known for getting what they needed, even if they had to take it from someone else.

Lucy was always caught in the middle, recognizing her ties to her family but also desiring to get out and see the world. Working under her father gave her the money she needed to get her education in nautical engineering and the training she needed to get a great job. She left her father's business and joined an outstanding company that assembled fleets of ships. She was very successful and living quite independently of her family. She loved her job at the new company and her superiors always treated her with respect and kindness, even mentoring her to be management in the future.

One day, however, she got word that her own company had received a bid on a project from an unlikely source: her father's company. The bid was the best by far, and looked as though it would help her company meet quarterly goals in a particularly tough economy. When her company identified the connection between her father's company and Lucy, they turned to her as a natural liaison between the two companies. However, when she reunites with her father, she does not receive the welcome she was expecting from a successful daughter returning home. Instead, he seethes with contempt that she did not come to use her skills to improve his company and make it more competitive. What she thought would be a joyous reunion turned into disappointment and sorrow. "Why," she asked, "Why did you request me as a liaison if you had such antipathy towards me?"

"Because there is one thing you can do for me, Lucy," her father says. "I fed you, clothed you, and brought you up to withstand the struggles of the real world. Now you can repay me and give your family the life it has always deserved. I don't need the paltry contract I got with your company. I just need you to tell me your new company's tactics and strategy. I've spent everything, including your brothers' lives, on a new design that will allow me to build fleets of

¹ Inspired by and derived from George R. R. Martin's *Game of Thrones* series, <http://georgerrmartin.com/>; http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/A_Game_of_Thrones; <http://www.hbo.com/game-of-thrones/index.html>.

ships as your company does. If I know their strategies, I'll be able to take over their business and we'll live like kings. But if you don't help me, I'll be leveraged too severely, and all that I've built will waste away. All of your brothers' and father's sacrifice's will be for naught. Work with me. We'll take what's ours."